

Final Evaluation Report

Your Details	
Full Name	Ericka Ceballos
Project Title	Monitoring the e-commerce of endangered wildlife animal species
Application ID	25935-C
Grant Amount	£14,800
Email Address	catcaews@gmail.com
Date of this Report	16-03-2022

1. Indicate the level of achievement of the project's original objectives and include any relevant comments on factors affecting this.

Objective	Not achieved	Partially achieved	Fully achieved	Comments
Assess the level, methods and level of the e-trade of endangered fauna species in Mexico				<p>The scale and methods of the e-commerce of fauna species was assessed in Mexico, Latin America and North America. We also monitored similar links suggested by Google. As well in all the Facebook pages similar to the ones we were checking in Mexico, but in Latin America and the North American Facebook.</p> <p>The level of the e-commerce of wildlife and of fauna species found traded is disturbing, and much higher than what we have found in prior years.</p>
Collect, analyse and compare the data gathered during the research				<p>We collected, analysed and compared all data obtained in 2019. The results were presented as a printed report at the CITES CoP 18 and in our different presentations from 2019 to date.</p> <p>Because the report was 54 pages long, we printed a much shorter version of the report (12 pages) for the CITES CoP 18 in Geneva, Switzerland. CEWS printed in total 500 reports, 500 high quality postcards and 1,500 high quality fliers in Spanish and English, with the report link and an introduction to our monitoring of the e-commerce of primate and felines in Mexico and Latin America, to distribute in our events in Geneva, Bolivia and Mexico. This was the best option for us to take, and also for the delegates to take home, especially during the CITES CoP meetings, where the delegates carry back home dozens of kilos of brochures and reports. We posted our 2019 report and all of our presentations online at our website, for everyone interested to be able to view it.</p>
Raising public awareness				<p>During the CITES CoP 18 in Geneva, CEWS spoke to media reporters, as well we</p>

				<p>handed postcards with our report information to journalists. We took part in an interview with British media and were interviewed by a Chinese journalist. Outside of CITES, we gave interviews to Bolivian, Peruvian, Spanish and Mexican media. CEWS has raised lots of public awareness, not only with the CITES member countries authorities in Geneva and Bolivia but also with PhD university students, media, as well other university, high school and even middle school students and teachers. Since the pandemic started, CEWS has been having presentations of this last work done in Zoom international environmental / animal welfare events, in Egypt, Mexico and Spain. so on. Soon after sending this final report, we will start to inform the media about our final results.</p>
Changes in the authorities, to protect endangered species from the e-commerce, by using the report for our CEWS lobbying activities.				<p>We created lots of awareness, praise and positive attention during the CITES CoP18 in 2019 with our report and presentations there in Geneva, in Bolivia and Mexico. We spoke during this event to many CITES enforcement and management authorities, PhD students, biologists, etc. But this is something that cannot be achieved instantly, as it needs work and constant interaction with the governments. The pandemic started just a few months later, so it set back all our work and also for all the governments and biologists working with them. Then to contact with CITES authorities became a real challenge, people got laid off at the governments and started to work from home, not answering emails and not having proper communication within their own departments. More work is needed, and CEWS will continue doing this at this CITES CoP19, either in person or/and virtually, to continue to add pressure, urging for the protection and conservation of many endangered species.</p>
Changes of the internet service providers attitude				<p>It has been a slow process, but it has improved a lot. This is an issue that will be dealt with by each internet service directly and most recently with Facebook. A lot</p>

<p>about the global e-commerce of endangered fauna, with the results of our report.</p>			<p>has changed from when we started to do our formal monitoring with the great support of Rufford in 2008. Many Mexican and Latin American classified websites and also bidding sites, have banned all sales of ivory, live fauna species and even sometimes all live domestic animals. In the last couple of years, CEWS noticed that many e-commerce sites have already banned all endangered animals' products and derivatives. These are big steps compared to how bad things were in those websites 14 years ago in Latin America. There is still a lot of work to do in this area, and CEWS will continue to do it. So overall we can say that it has been achieved, but it still requires more work.</p>
---	--	--	---

2. Please explain any unforeseen difficulties that arose during the project and how these were tackled.

The second part of our monitoring started just before the pandemic hit the world.

During 2020 and part of 2021, we had serious technical issues with our team laptops, but we could not take them to repair, as the technician store was closed. There was one place open, but the waiting time was at least 4 months. That delayed all our work a lot. Another colleague lost all her data captured in a couple of months twice, so we had to re-do it all over again, when her computer finally died. Another colleague had Wi-Fi problems as her Wi-Fi box was damaged but could not get it fixed as the internet service provider was not allowing its technicians to go inside the apartments during the lockdown. It took months to fix it. In total we easily lost about a year of work. That is the reason why we are so delayed in providing this final report.

Another issue is that we keep finding endangered and non-endangered fauna species on Facebook and classified ads websites that we haven't seen before.

When checking these pages or websites, we kept finding all these new Facebook pages and classified ads not only in Mexico and Latin America, but also in Spain, Japan, Canada and the US. It was something that we could just not ignore, as this shows how big the e-commerce problem is.

The main problem is that we could never end this monitoring, and it is hard to have ended it, as many more fauna species will not appear on our report.

Every day we found more ads, pages and more endangered species openly sold on the American e-commerce. We tried to end it many times, but it was impossible. CEWS team's priority is about exposing the e-commerce of all fauna species trapped in this exploitative e-commerce. Why? To get these fauna species more protection and conservation from CITES member countries is needed, from the government

authorities where these species are native, to the species who have not had any scientific assessment, which need to be researched to be able to protect and conserve locally and at an international level.

Another issue is that due to all the technical difficulties which we experienced during the pandemic, and after losing so much data and time, it would take too long to gather all the data which we were collecting. Instead, we focused on finding new fauna species and markets not detected before.

The recent increased international demand for CEWS to have presentations to non-scientific authorities or biologists of our e-commerce of wildlife monitoring, pushed us to make our last two reports in an easier way to understand it for the general public and students.

CEWS ended the funds in 2020, so we continued to do it on a voluntary basis.

3. Briefly describe the three most important outcomes of your project.

1) The CEWS team found many more endangered and non-endangered fauna species than we ever expected, as well as many new online markets, so we brought in 2019 and will continue to bring this to the attention of the CITES authorities at the CITES CoP19 this year, but also with the classified and e-store website managers and Facebook owners.

2) CEWS suspected that amphibians, arthropods, fishes, other marine life and reptiles could be quite popular in the e-commerce. This turned out to be a shocking reality, especially with the arthropods marine life and reptiles widely found all over the internet and Facebook. But because these animals are not "charismatic species", they fall undetected, neglected and forgotten under the giant jaws of the world wide web. Our 2019 Report distributed at the CITES CoP18 together with the lobbying activities from our representative, assisted in helping to protect (or further protect by transferring the species to Appendix I) of the following endangered species: giraffe, guitarfishes, wedgefishes, mako sharks, ornamental spiders, Asian warty, crocodile and spiny newts, pancake and star tortoises, spiny tailed iguanas, gecko species, lizard species, and black crowned crane. As well it helped to avoid the down listing and transferring the populations of African elephants from Southern African countries to Appendix II, which would have allowed the trade in registered ivory, hunting trophies, hides and leather goods, and two similar proposals for down listing the rhinoceros populations of Zambia and Eswatini, which would have allowed the commercial trade in rhinoceros horn.

3) CEWS reports, presentations and talks have created lots of awareness to the general public in so many different countries. Our project coordinator was honoured to have been part of a primate trade panel of experts, in a joint event, along with our referee for this grant, the Ian Redmond, during the CITES CoP18. Our CEWS representative there, spoke about our results on the e-commerce of primates in Mexico and Latin America, along with other two renowned primatologists. Our representative was invited by the Bolivian Government to participate at the First Illegal Jaguar Trade Workshop in Santa Cruz, Bolivia. There CEWS had a public educative

table of our monitoring and gave two different presentations about our findings of the illegal trade of jaguars and other felines in Latin America, for the CITES representatives from all over Latin America, biologists, media, and so on.

The demand for our results and experiences, either in the form of presentations, reports and talks inside and outside of the CITES community, is something that all of our team is very glad to provide. As soon as the pandemic allows it, CEWS intends to host educational events here in Canada, about our work.

4. Briefly describe the involvement of local communities and how they have benefitted from the project.

Local community conservation people, teachers and rangers fighting the illegal trade of endangered wildlife, have used our reports to create a general awareness at local educational events.

5. Are there any plans to continue this work?

CEWS would like to continue monitoring the e-commerce of fauna species.

6. How do you plan to share the results of your work with others?

Printed version of the report, online version of our report, by email, in person, in presentations, talks and Zoom/ Skype meetings.

7. Timescale: Over what period was the grant used? How does this compare to the anticipated or actual length of the project?

For 2 years we used the grant, and for 1 ½ years it was just the volunteer work from our colleagues in Canada and Mexico. It took almost twice as long as we expected, because our team kept finding more ads and many new animal species.

8. Budget: Provide a breakdown of budgeted versus actual expenditure and the reasons for any differences. All figures should be in £ sterling, indicating the local exchange rate used. It is important that you retain the management accounts and all paid invoices relating to the project for at least 2 years as these may be required for inspection at our discretion.

Item	Budgeted amount	Actual Amount	Difference	Comments
Monitoring the e-c of great apes and other protected animal species in Mexico	8750	11245	+2495	The time frame of the monitoring was much greater than our team anticipated

ACWF monitoring) In-kind contributions estimated value)	8700	8700		
Analysing the captured data results	350	420	+160	
Writing the report	500	500		
Editing the report	200	360	+160	
Printing 550 issues	1845	1640	-205	
Coordination of the project	2300	1817	-483	
Distribution (postal)	250	219	-31	
Distribution (PDF)				
Other costs (inc. computer technician, repairs, etc.)	605	1129	+524	
Total project costs	23500	26030		
Total CATCA EWS cost	14800	17330	+2530	

9. Looking ahead, what do you feel are the important next steps?

CEWS will continue to monitor the international e-commerce of fauna species. We will also continue to contact the website owners/managers and social media owners, to urge them to ban CITES protected species, and hopefully all fauna species (live, derivatives and products). CEWS will also continue to inform the CITES authorities about our results and findings, as well carry on with educational talks and presentations to create a general awareness, to further protect the wild animals exploited on the international e-commerce.

10. Did you use The Rufford Foundation logo in any materials produced in relation to this project? Did the Foundation receive any publicity during the course of your work?

Of course! We used it in each report printed out, and on each of our online reports and presentations (live and on Zoom), we have always used the RF logo, and acknowledge the great support which we received by Rufford Foundation. We also used it on our banners at educational tables in 2019. The acknowledgement of support of RSGF is also on our website.

11. Please provide a full list of all the members of your team and briefly what was their role in the project.

Megan Monkman

Monitoring the e-c of exotic leathers used in Mexico, editing

Ing. Hanna Lizarraga

Monitoring the e-c of classified ads site in Mexico, designing and writing the 2022 report (Spanish)

Ing. Abelardo Ramirez

Monitoring the e-c of mammals on the Mexican Facebook

Renea Mohammed

Monitoring the e-c of arthropods and reptiles on the www in Latin America

MSc Lauren Young

Monitoring the general e-c of wildlife in Mexico

Annelise Sorg

Monitoring the e-c of birds and fishes on the www in Latin America

Ericka Ceballos

Monitoring and coordinating the e-c of mammals, arthropods, birds, amphibians, reptiles, fishes and other marine life in Facebook and the www writing and designing the report 2019 & 2022.

12. Any other comments?

Our team has a bittersweet feeling after finally completing our RF Completion Grant.

It has been a very interesting and fascinating journey, which has brought our team so much knowledge, expertise and awareness about the e-commerce of endangered fauna species at a global level.

We could not have been able to launch these international monitoring and achieve all of our successes and international awareness, without the great support from Rufford Foundation which has kindly supported fourteen years of monitoring the e-commerce of protected wildlife.

On behalf of all the CEWS Team, **THANK YOU** for allowing us to launch this activity, to help so many endangered animals worldwide, exploited by the e-commerce of wildlife.